An energy-preserving unconditionally stable fractional step method on collocated grids

D. Santos, F. X. Trias, G. Colomer, A. Oliva

Heat and Mass Transfer Technological Center, Technical University of Catalonia, C/Colom 11, 08222 Terrassa (Barcelona)

05-09 June 2022, ECCOMAS 2022, Oslo, Norway



- Motivation: Find an energy-preserving unconditionally stable fractional step method on collocated grids.
- 2 Symmetry-Preserving discretization of NS equations on collocated unstructured grids.
- 3 Conservation of global kinetic energy.
- A stable pressure gradient interpolation for the velocity correction.
- 5 Air-filled differentially heated cavity for extremely distorted unstructured meshes.

・ロト ・ 四ト ・ ヨト ・ ヨト … ヨ

6 Conclusions.

1. Motivation of this work

Motivation: Is it possible to find an energy-preserving unconditionally stable fractional step method on collocated grids for any mesh?



Figure 1: Example of a highly distorted mesh.

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

Motivation of this work



Figure 2: Zoom of the top part of the previous mesh.

・ロト ・四ト ・ヨト・ヨト

Incompressible NS equations

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla)\mathbf{u} = \frac{1}{Re} \Delta \mathbf{u} - \nabla \rho, \qquad (1)$$
$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} = 0. \qquad (2)$$

・ロト ・四ト ・ヨト・ヨト・

э



Figure 3: General unstrucured mesh.

Let us suppose we have n control volumes and m faces.

Finite volume discretization of incompressible NS equations on an arbitrary collocated mesh

$$\Omega \frac{d\mathbf{u}_{c}}{dt} + C(\mathbf{u}_{s})\mathbf{u}_{c} = -D\mathbf{u}_{c} - \Omega G_{c}\mathbf{p}_{c}, \qquad (3)$$
$$M\mathbf{u}_{s} = \mathbf{0}_{c}. \qquad (4)$$

ヘロト 不得 トイヨト イヨト ニヨー

- $\mathbf{p}_c = (p_1, ..., p_n)^T \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is the cell-centered pressure.
- $\mathbf{u}_c = (\mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \mathbf{u}_3)^T \in \mathbb{R}^{3n}$, where $\mathbf{u}_i = ((u_i)_1, ..., (u_i)_n)^T$ are the vectors containing the velocity components corresponding to the x_i -spatial direction.
- $\mathbf{u}_s = ((u_s)_1, ..., (u_s)_m)^T \in \mathbb{R}^m$ is the staggered velocity.
- The velocities are related via the interpolator from cells to faces $\Gamma_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times 3n} \implies \mathbf{u}_s = \Gamma_{c \to s} \mathbf{u}_c.$

Let us suppose we have n control volumes and m faces.

Finite volume discretization of incompressible NS equations on an arbitrary collocated mesh

$$\Omega \frac{d\mathbf{u}_{c}}{dt} + C(\mathbf{u}_{s})\mathbf{u}_{c} = -D\mathbf{u}_{c} - \Omega G_{c}\mathbf{p}_{c}, \qquad (3)$$
$$M\mathbf{u}_{s} = \mathbf{0}_{c}. \qquad (4)$$

・ロット (四) ・ (日) ・ (日) ・ (日)

- $\mathbf{p}_c = (p_1, ..., p_n)^T \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is the cell-centered pressure.
- $\mathbf{u}_c = (\mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \mathbf{u}_3)^T \in \mathbb{R}^{3n}$, where $\mathbf{u}_i = ((u_i)_1, ..., (u_i)_n)^T$ are the vectors containing the velocity components corresponding to the x_i -spatial direction.
- $\mathbf{u}_s = ((u_s)_1, ..., (u_s)_m)^T \in \mathbb{R}^m$ is the staggered velocity.
- The velocities are related via the interpolator from cells to faces $\Gamma_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times 3n} \implies \mathbf{u}_s = \Gamma_{c \to s} \mathbf{u}_c.$

Let us suppose we have n control volumes and m faces.

Finite volume discretization of incompressible NS equations on an arbitrary collocated mesh

$$\Omega \frac{d\mathbf{u}_{c}}{dt} + C(\mathbf{u}_{s})\mathbf{u}_{c} = -D\mathbf{u}_{c} - \Omega G_{c}\mathbf{p}_{c}, \qquad (3)$$
$$M\mathbf{u}_{s} = \mathbf{0}_{c}. \qquad (4)$$

・ロット 御り とほう とほう 二日

• $\mathbf{p}_c = (p_1, ..., p_n)^T \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is the cell-centered pressure.

• $\mathbf{u}_c = (\mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \mathbf{u}_3)^T \in \mathbb{R}^{3n}$, where $\mathbf{u}_i = ((u_i)_1, ..., (u_i)_n)^T$ are the vectors containing the velocity components corresponding to the x_i -spatial direction.

•
$$\mathbf{u}_s = ((u_s)_1, ..., (u_s)_m)^T \in \mathbb{R}^m$$
 is the staggered velocity.

• The velocities are related via the interpolator from cells to faces $\Gamma_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times 3n} \implies \mathbf{u}_s = \Gamma_{c \to s} \mathbf{u}_c.$

Let us suppose we have n control volumes and m faces.

Finite volume discretization of incompressible NS equations on an arbitrary collocated mesh

$$\Omega \frac{d\mathbf{u}_{c}}{dt} + C(\mathbf{u}_{s})\mathbf{u}_{c} = -D\mathbf{u}_{c} - \Omega G_{c}\mathbf{p}_{c}, \qquad (3)$$
$$M\mathbf{u}_{s} = \mathbf{0}_{c}. \qquad (4)$$

ヘロト 不得 トイヨト イヨト 二日

- $\mathbf{p}_c = (p_1, ..., p_n)^T \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is the cell-centered pressure.
- $\mathbf{u}_c = (\mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \mathbf{u}_3)^T \in \mathbb{R}^{3n}$, where $\mathbf{u}_i = ((u_i)_1, ..., (u_i)_n)^T$ are the vectors containing the velocity components corresponding to the x_i -spatial direction.

•
$$\mathbf{u}_s = ((u_s)_1, ..., (u_s)_m)^T \in \mathbb{R}^m$$
 is the staggered velocity.

• The velocities are related via the interpolator from cells to faces $\Gamma_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times 3n} \implies \mathbf{u}_s = \Gamma_{c \to s} \mathbf{u}_c.$

Let us suppose we have n control volumes and m faces.

Finite volume discretization of incompressible NS equations on an arbitrary collocated mesh

$$\Omega \frac{d\mathbf{u}_{c}}{dt} + C(\mathbf{u}_{s})\mathbf{u}_{c} = -D\mathbf{u}_{c} - \Omega G_{c}\mathbf{p}_{c}, \qquad (3)$$
$$M\mathbf{u}_{s} = \mathbf{0}_{c}. \qquad (4)$$

ヘロト 不得 トイヨト イヨト ニヨー

- $\mathbf{p}_c = (p_1, ..., p_n)^T \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is the cell-centered pressure.
- $\mathbf{u}_c = (\mathbf{u}_1, \mathbf{u}_2, \mathbf{u}_3)^T \in \mathbb{R}^{3n}$, where $\mathbf{u}_i = ((u_i)_1, ..., (u_i)_n)^T$ are the vectors containing the velocity components corresponding to the x_i -spatial direction.
- $\mathbf{u}_s = ((u_s)_1, ..., (u_s)_m)^T \in \mathbb{R}^m$ is the staggered velocity.
- The velocities are related via the interpolator from cells to faces $\Gamma_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times 3n} \implies \mathbf{u}_s = \Gamma_{c \to s} \mathbf{u}_c.$

$$\Gamma_{c \to s} = N \Pi, \tag{5}$$

通 ト イ ヨ ト イ ヨ ト

э

where

N = (N_{s,x}N_{s,y}N_{s,z}) ∈ ℝ^{m×3m} where N_{s,x}, N_{s,y}, N_{s,z} ∈ ℝ^{m×m} are diagonal matrices containing the x_i spatial component of the face normal vectors.

•
$$\Pi = I_3 \otimes \Pi_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{3m \times 3n}$$

• $\Pi_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ is the scalar cell-to-face interpolator.

$$\Gamma_{c \to s} = N \Pi, \tag{5}$$

通 ト イヨ ト イヨ ト

3

where

• $N = (N_{s,x}N_{s,y}N_{s,z}) \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times 3m}$ where $N_{s,x}, N_{s,y}, N_{s,z} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times m}$ are diagonal matrices containing the x_i spatial component of the face normal vectors.

•
$$\Pi = I_3 \otimes \Pi_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{3m \times 3n}$$

• $\Pi_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ is the scalar cell-to-face interpolator.

$$\Gamma_{c \to s} = N \Pi, \tag{5}$$

• • = • • = •

where

N = (N_{s,x}N_{s,y}N_{s,z}) ∈ ℝ^{m×3m} where N_{s,x}, N_{s,y}, N_{s,z} ∈ ℝ^{m×m} are diagonal matrices containing the x_i spatial component of the face normal vectors.

•
$$\Pi = I_3 \otimes \Pi_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{3m \times 3n}$$

• $\Pi_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ is the scalar cell-to-face interpolator.

$$\Gamma_{c \to s} = N \Pi, \tag{5}$$

• • = • • = •

where

N = (N_{s,x}N_{s,y}N_{s,z}) ∈ ℝ^{m×3m} where N_{s,x}, N_{s,y}, N_{s,z} ∈ ℝ^{m×m} are diagonal matrices containing the x_i spatial component of the face normal vectors.

•
$$\Pi = I_3 \otimes \Pi_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{3m \times 3m}$$

• $\prod_{c \to s} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ is the scalar cell-to-face interpolator.

• Image: A image:

Finally,

- $G_c \in \mathbb{R}^{3n \times n}$ represents the discrete collocated gradient.
- $M \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$ is the face-to-cell discrete divergence operator.

- $\Omega_c \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is a diagonal matrix with the cell-centered volumes $\implies \Omega = I_3 \otimes \Omega_c$.
- $C_c(\mathbf{u}_s) \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is the cell-centered convective operator for a discrete scalar field $\implies C(\mathbf{u}_s) = I_3 \otimes C_c(\mathbf{u}_s)$.
- $D_c \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is the cell-centered diffusive operator for a discrete scalar field $\implies D = I_3 \otimes D_c$.

▲□ ▶ ▲ 三 ▶ ▲ 三 ▶ ▲ 三 ● ● ● ●

Finally,

- $G_c \in \mathbb{R}^{3n imes n}$ represents the discrete collocated gradient.
- $M \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$ is the face-to-cell discrete divergence operator.

- $\Omega_c \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is a diagonal matrix with the cell-centered volumes $\implies \Omega = I_3 \otimes \Omega_c.$
- $C_c(\mathbf{u}_s) \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is the cell-centered convective operator for a discrete scalar field $\implies C(\mathbf{u}_s) = I_3 \otimes C_c(\mathbf{u}_s).$
- $D_c \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is the cell-centered diffusive operator for a discrete scalar field $\implies D = I_3 \otimes D_c.$

Finally,

۲

 $G_c \in \mathbb{R}^{3n \times n}$ represents the discrete collocated gradient.

- 4 回 ト 4 三 ト - 三 - シックの

 $M \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$ is the face-to-cell discrete divergence operator.

$$G = -\Omega_s^{-1}M^T,$$

$$L = MG = -M\Omega_s^{-1}M^T,$$

$$L_c = M_c G_c = -M\Gamma_{c \to s}\Omega^{-1}\Gamma_{c \to s}^T M^T,$$

$$\Gamma_{s \to c} = \Omega^{-1}\Gamma_{c \to s}^T\Omega_s.$$
(6)

・ロット (四) ・ (日) ・ (日) ・ (日)

where G is the center-to-face staggered gradient, L is the Laplacian operator, L_c is the collocated-Laplacian operator and $\Gamma_{s \rightarrow c}$ is the face-to-cell interpolator.

$$G = -\Omega_s^{-1}M^T,$$

$$L = MG = -M\Omega_s^{-1}M^T,$$

$$L_c = M_c G_c = -M\Gamma_{c \to s}\Omega^{-1}\Gamma_{c \to s}^TM^T,$$

$$\Gamma_{s \to c} = \Omega^{-1}\Gamma_{c \to s}^T\Omega_s.$$
(6)

・ロット (四) ・ (日) ・ (日) ・ (日)

where G is the center-to-face staggered gradient, L is the Laplacian operator, L_c is the collocated-Laplacian operator and $\Gamma_{s\rightarrow c}$ is the face-to-cell interpolator.

$$G = -\Omega_s^{-1} M^T,$$

$$L = MG = -M\Omega_s^{-1} M^T,$$

$$L_c = M_c G_c = -M\Gamma_{c \to s} \Omega^{-1} \Gamma_{c \to s}^T M^T,$$

$$\Gamma_{s \to c} = \Omega^{-1} \Gamma_{c \to s}^T \Omega_s.$$
(6)

・ロット (四) ・ (日) ・ (日) ・ (日)

where G is the center-to-face staggered gradient, L is the Laplacian operator, L_c is the collocated-Laplacian operator and $\Gamma_{s\rightarrow c}$ is the face-to-cell interpolator.

$$G = -\Omega_s^{-1} M^T,$$

$$L = MG = -M\Omega_s^{-1} M^T,$$

$$L_c = M_c G_c = -M\Gamma_{c \to s} \Omega^{-1} \Gamma_{c \to s}^T M^T,$$

$$\Gamma_{s \to c} = \Omega^{-1} \Gamma_{c \to s}^T \Omega_s.$$
(6)

・ロット (四) ・ (日) ・ (日) ・ (日)

where G is the center-to-face staggered gradient, L is the Laplacian operator, L_c is the collocated-Laplacian operator and $\Gamma_{s\rightarrow c}$ is the face-to-cell interpolator.

Global kinetic energy equation

$$\frac{d||\mathbf{u}_c||^2}{dt} = -\mathbf{u}_c^T (C(\mathbf{u}_s) + C^T(\mathbf{u}_s))\mathbf{u}_c - \mathbf{u}_c^T (D + D^T)\mathbf{u}_c -\mathbf{u}_c^T \Omega G_c \mathbf{p}_c - \mathbf{p}_c^T G_c^T \Omega^T \mathbf{u}_c.$$
(7)

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆ ヨ▶ ◆ ヨト ● ヨー ���

In absence of diffusion, that is D = 0, the global kinetic energy is conserved if:

C(u_s) = -C^T(u_s), i.e, the convective operator should be skew-symmetric.
 (-ΩG_c)^T = MΓ_{c→s}, because Mu_s = 0_c.

Question: Can we find a mathematical reason to justify these relations, instead of a physical one?

Mimicking continuos properties



- A and B are two vectorial spaces.
- π_h is a discretization operator.
- T is a continuous operator.
- A_h , B_h and T_h are the discrete counterparts of A, B and T, respectively.

▲□ ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ ▲ 臣 ▶ □ 臣 □ ∽ � ♥ ♥

We will require this diagram to be commutative.

Mimicking continuos properties: relation between gradient and divergence operators

• From a continuos level, the adjoint operator of the divergence is the gradient:

$$< \nabla \cdot a | b > = - < a | \nabla b >,$$
 (8)

where $\langle a|b \rangle = \int_{\Omega} abdV$ represents the inner product of functions. The discrete counterpart of the inner product is $\langle a_h|b_h \rangle_{\Omega} = a_h^T \Omega b_h$.

• Applying π_h to (8) we obtain:

$$<\Omega_1^{-1}Ma_h|b_h>_{\Omega_1}=-_{\Omega_2}.$$
(9)

If $\Omega_1 = \Omega$ and $\Omega_2 = \Omega_s$, then:

$$G = -\Omega_s^{-1} M^T.$$
(10)

• Finally, from the skew-symmetry of the continuos convective operator follows that $C(u_s)$ should be skew-symmetric.

Solving 1D NS equations with a fractional step method interpolating the pressure gradient with a mid-point scheme (checkerboard is not corrected):



通 ト イ ヨ ト イ ヨ ト



Figure 6: Vel. for max. aspect ratio 20 (mid-point scheme)

Figure 7: Eigenvalues of $L - L_c$

くぼう くほう くほう



Figure 8: Vel. for max. aspect ratio 40 (mid-point scheme)



Figure 9: Eigenvalues of $L - L_c$

くぼう くほう くほう

- Mid-point scheme: $\phi_f = \frac{1}{2}(\phi_{c1} + \phi_{c2})$.
- Volume weighted scheme: $\phi_f = \frac{V_{s1}}{V_{s1}+V_{s2}}\phi_{c1} + \frac{V_{s2}}{V_{s1}+V_{s2}}\phi_{c2}$.



Figure 10: Volume weighted volumes

・聞き ・ 国を ・ 国を …



(volume weighted scheme)

Figure 12: Eigenvalues of $L - L_c$

< 同 > < 三 > < 三 >

FSM iterative Poisson equation in collocated meshes

$$L\tilde{p}_c^{n+1} = M_c u_c^n \quad \longrightarrow \quad u_c^{n+1} = u_c^n - G_c \tilde{p}_c^{n+1}, \tag{11}$$

where $M_c = M\Gamma_{c\to s}$ and $G_c = \Gamma_{s\to c}G = -\Omega_c^{-1}\Gamma_{c\to s}^T M^T$ are the collocated divergence and the collocated gradient. Developing the correction in u_c^n :

$$u_{c}^{n} = u_{c}^{n-1} - G_{c}\tilde{p}_{c}^{n} = u_{c}^{n-2} - G_{c}\tilde{p}_{c}^{n} - G_{c}\tilde{p}_{c}^{n-1} = \dots = u_{c}^{p} - G_{c}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\tilde{p}_{c}^{i} \qquad (12)$$

So, the acumulated pressure at n iteration is:

$$p_c^n = \sum_{i=1}^n \tilde{p}_c^i \tag{13}$$

イロト 不同 トイヨト イヨト

Introducing all this in (7) we obtain:

$$Lp_c^{n+1} = M\Gamma_{c\to s}u_c^p + (L - L_c)p_c^n.$$
⁽¹⁴⁾

- In order to obtain stable solutions, we require the eigenvalues of $L L_c$ to be negative.
- This can be achieved by using the volume weighted scheme:

$$\Pi_{c \to s} = \Delta_s^{-1} \Delta_{sc}^{\mathcal{T}},\tag{15}$$

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ● ● ○ ○ ○ ○

where $\Delta_s \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times m}$ is a diagonal matrix containing the projected distances between two adjacent control volumes, and $\Delta_{sc} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ is a matrix containing the projected distances between an adjacent cell node and its corresponding face.

• It is relatively easy to prove it for cartesian meshes and their stretchings, but it is not easy to prove for a general triangular mesh.

This problem was widely adressed in: D. Santos, J. Muela, N. Valle, F.X. Trias, On the Interpolation Problem for the Poisson Equation on Collocated Meshes. 14th WCCM-ECCOMAS Congress 2020, DOI: 10.23967/wccm-eccomas.2020.257. **Motivation**: It is easy to prove that a Cartesian mesh meet the previous criteria, but it is not easy to prove it for rotated Cartesian meshes.

Result 4

The definiteness of $L - L_c$ is invariant under rotations of the mesh.

- The face-normal vectors are contained in the matrix N.
- A generalized rotation matrix *R* can be constructed in order to change properly the matrix N.
- As N is inside Γ_{c→s} (which is inside L_c), changing the basis will lead us to a new volumetric interpolator Γ^{new}_{c→s}.

・ロト ・ 四ト ・ ヨト ・ ヨト … ヨ

In order to check the stability of the method, some tests have been carried out with very coarse and very bad quality meshes. Here, a differentially heated cavity test is presented:

- Air-filled (Pr = 0.71).
- Aspect ratio 2.
- Rayleigh number (based on the cavity height) of 10^6 .

The symmetries of the operators have been respected and a volume weighted interpolator was used to interpolate the pressure gradient.

Remark: Using a mid point scheme will blow up the simulation at the beginning.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆ ヨ▶ ◆ ヨ▶ ● ヨ ● ��や

Air-filled differentially heated cavity for extremely distorted unstructured meshes



Figure 13: Mesh used to run the case.

《曰》 《聞》 《臣》 《臣》

Air-filled differentially heated cavity for extremely distorted unstructured meshes.



Figure 14: Pressure distribution.

Figure 15: Temperature distribution.

- 4 同 6 4 日 6 4 日 6

Air-filled differentially heated cavity for extremely distorted unstructured meshes.



Figure 16: Velocity distribution in x-direction.

Figure 17: Velocity distribution in y-direction.

A (10) × (10)

- An energy-preserving unconditionally stable fractional step method on collocated grids has been presented.
- There are mathematical reasons beyond physical ones in order to preserve the underlying symmetries of the differential operators.
- The appearance of unphysical velocities is a common problem found in highly distorted meshes, and it commes from the interpolation of the pressure gradient in the velocity correction.
- The volume weighted scheme solves this problem for Cartesian meshes.
- For unstructured triangular meshes, it seems that it can be also stable. At least, it is much more stable than a mid-point interpolation.

・ロト ・四ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

э